ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD STAFF REPORT

Project #/Name	**ARB-2019-128: Stonefield D1 Preliminary**
Review Type	Preliminary Review of a Site Plan and Architectural Design
Parcel Identification	061W00300019A0
Location	East of Hydraulic Road, between Inglewood Drive and District Avenue, currently a parking lot fronting Hydraulic
Zoned	Neighborhood Model District (NMD), Entrance Corridor (EC)
Owner/Applicant	OCT Stonefield Property Owner LLC/W W Associates (Herb White)
Magisterial District	Jack Jouett
Proposal	To construct a 6-8-story apartment building with 234 units and associated site improvements. A Special Exception is required for the proposed height.
Context/History	The site is located within the Stonefield development, for which the ARB has reviewed and approved numerous applications. Nearby buildings have been approved with heights above 5 stories. These include the Hyatt Place Hotel to the north at 6 stories, the Hyatt House hotel to the northeast at 6 stories (not yet constructed), and a mixed-use building at Bond and Inglewood to the northwest at 6 stories (not yet constructed). The Regal movie theater is to the southeast. Townhouses are to the west.
Visibility	The apartment building will be readily visible from the Hydraulic Road Entrance Corridor and the upper stories of the building will be visible from a distance on the Rt. 29 Entrance Corridor.
ARB Meeting Date	December 16, 2019
Staff Contact	Margaret Maliszewski and Khris Taggart

ANALYSIS

REF	GUIDELINE	ISSUE	RECOMMENDATION
	GENERAL GUIDELINES		
	Purpose, Compatibility with significant historic sites, **Structure design**		
1	The goal of the regulation of the design of development within the designated Entrance Corridors is to insure that new development within the corridors reflects the traditional architecture of the area. Therefore, it is the purpose of ARB review and of these Guidelines, that proposed development within the designated Entrance Corridors reflect elements of design characteristic of the significant historical landmarks, buildings, and structures of the Charlottesville and Albemarle area, and to promote orderly and attractive development within these corridors. Applicants should note that replication of historic structures is neither required nor desired.	The primary building material is Hardie siding (lap, shiplap, reveal panel system, and panels with trim). Brick is used as a secondary material in one bay of the Hydraulic elevation, and along a portion of the base on the side streets. A color print of the materials has been submitted (samples have not). The brick is red with dark brown/black accents, siding is off-white, gray and bronze. Trim is sand/tan. These colors and materials appear to be compatible with those approved in the Stonefield shopping center, the Regal Cinema and the Block D2 Phase 2 building, as well as the materials proposed for the Hyatt House Hotel, but samples are needed for confirmation. Each of the line drawing elevations includes a portion rendered in color with material/color call-outs. For clarity, call-outs are needed for the full elevations; full colored elevations would be helpful. Although individual elements of the design are traceable to historic buildings in the area (masonry base, grouped windows, stringcourses and secondary cornices, emphasized roofline), the overall building is not a strong reflection the historic architecture of the area. The Hydraulic elevation has multiple parts, which helps break up the mass of the building and establish a rhythm, but the elevation lacks a sense of organization, focus and hierarchy	Provide for review samples of the proposed materials and colors. Revise the Hydraulic Road elevation to present more of a "primary façade" appearance in line with the materials, balance and use of hierarchy displayed in the Bond Street elevation. To better determine appropriateness of the 6-story building height along Hydraulic Road, provide the following for review: • A Hydraulic Road street elevation showing the apartment building, the townhouses and the cinema. • A "perspective" image showing the Hydraulic elevation head-on. • Perspectives from the Hydraulic/Inglewood and Hydraulic/District intersections, clearly showing the building elevations along Hydraulic
2	Visitors to the significant historical sites in the Charlottesville and Albemarle area experience these sites as ensembles of buildings, land, and vegetation. In order to accomplish the integration of buildings, land, and vegetation characteristic of these sites, the Guidelines require attention to four primary factors: compatibility with significant historic sites in the area; the character of the Entrance Corridor; site development and layout; and landscaping.		
3	New structures and substantial additions to existing structures should respect the traditions of the architecture of historically significant buildings in the Charlottesville and Albemarle area. Photographs of historic buildings in the area, as well as drawings of architectural features, which provide important examples of this tradition are contained in Appendix A.		
4	The examples contained in Appendix A should be used as a guide for building design: the standard of compatibility with the area's historic structures is not		

	intended to impose a rigid design solution for new development. Replication of the design of the important historic sites in the area is neither intended nor desired. The Guideline's standard of compatibility can be met through building scale, materials, and forms which may be embodied in architecture which is contemporary as well as traditional. The Guidelines allow individuality in design to accommodate varying tastes as well as special functional requirements.	that is appropriate for an EC-facing elevation. The Bond Street elevation, which is not visible from the Hydraulic, exhibits that level of organization and hierarchy with prominent brick towers balanced with a regular distribution of window bays, rooftop detail and secondary cornices. Incorporating these characteristics into the Hydraulic elevation would be appropriate.	and the side streets. Provide for review the full line drawing elevations in color with material/color call-outs.
9	Building forms and features, including roofs, windows, doors, materials, colors and textures should be compatible with the forms and features of the significant historic buildings in the area, exemplified by (but not limited to) the buildings described in Appendix A [of the design guidelines]. The standard of compatibility can be met through scale, materials, and forms which may be embodied in architecture which is contemporary as well as traditional. The replication of important historic sites in Albemarle County is not the objective of these guidelines.	The District and Inglewood elevations are quite long. They are broken into bays with treatments similar to those used on the Hydraulic elevation, and they have the same lack of hierarchy. Perspectives with a broader view taken from the Hydraulic/Inglewood and Hydraulic/District intersections, showing the elevations along the side streets, would be useful in determining if the forms, scale and detailing are appropriate.	
12	Architecture proposed within the Entrance Corridor should use forms, shapes, scale, and materials to create a cohesive whole.	The six-story building height is expected to appear compatible with other taller buildings internal to the shopping center. The submitted images don't clearly show that the building will be compatible with the neighboring buildings on Hydraulic. The angle of the perspective images provided along Hydraulic Road does not allow a clear comparison of the apartment building height and form to the height and form of the adjacent townhouses and cinema. Perspectives with a broader view, in addition to a street elevation including the townhouses, apartment building, and cinema, would be useful in determining compatibility and appropriateness of the request for the special exception.	
5	It is also an important objective of the Guidelines to	The proposed building height is similar to that	

	establish a pattern of compatible architectural characteristics throughout the Entrance Corridor in order to achieve unity and coherence. Building designs should demonstrate sensitivity to other nearby structures within the Entrance Corridor. Where a designated corridor is substantially developed, these Guidelines require striking a careful balance between harmonizing new development with the existing character of the corridor and achieving compatibility with the significant historic sites in the area.	of the Hyatt Place hotel, the Hyatt House hotel (not yet approved), and the Block D2 Phase 2 building (all 6 stories). Those buildings are all set back further from the Hydraulic Road corridor. Along Hydraulic, the proposed apartment building is 5 and 6 stories tall at approximately 57' and 65' high. The townhouse block to the west has 2 stories plus a full roof, with an approximate height of 36' above street level. The cinema to the east is a blocky form at about 40' high. The form, height, and general character and treatment of each of these buildings is very different. The submitted images don't clearly show that the building will be compatible with the neighboring buildings on Hydraulic. Streetscape views showing more of the proposed building and more of the townhouse block and cinema would be helpful in determining compatibility along the corridor. The apartment design includes horizontal roof elements with a deep projection that are similar in appearance elements on the Hyatt House and Block D2 buildings. The proposed building is situated approximately 1200' from the Rt. 29 Entrance Corridor. The upper stories of the building will be visible from the Rt. 29 EC and, at that distance, is expected to have an appropriate appearance.	
10	Buildings should relate to their site and the surrounding context of buildings.		
11	The overall design of buildings should have human scale. Scale should be integral to the building and site design.	The apartment building is a large one. The design attempts to break the large size down in multiple ways – with material and color changes, projections, changes in depth, and varying heights. This provides some variety and rhythm and human-scaled elements for	Revise the EC frontage landscaping to promote human scale.

		drivers and pedestrians to relate to, but the overall large size will be the primary impression. Alternate landscaping could enhance the human scale.	
13	Any appearance of "blankness" resulting from building design should be relieved using design detail or vegetation, or both.	Blankness is not a characteristic of the proposed design.	None.
14	Arcades, colonnades, or other architectural connecting devices should be used to unify groups of buildings within a development.	Connecting devices are not proposed and have not been used in the development to date.	None.
15	Trademark buildings and related features should be modified to meet the requirements of the Guidelines.	The proposal does not have the appearance of a trademark design.	None.
16	Window glass in the Entrance Corridors should not be highly tinted or highly reflective. Window glass in the Entrance Corridors should meet the following criteria: *Visible light transmittance (VLT) shall not drop below 40%. Visible light reflectance (VLR) shall not exceed 30%. Specifications on the proposed window glass should be submitted with the application for final review.*	Window glass is not addressed in the proposal.	Provide specs and a sample for the proposed window glass. Include the standard window glass note on the architectural drawings.
	Accessory structures and equipment		
17	Accessory structures and equipment should be integrated into the overall plan of development and shall, to the extent possible, be compatible with the building designs used on the site.	There is some existing equipment along and near the EC street. No additional equipment is shown on the plan. With the proposed 6-story height, rooftop equipment is not expected to be an issue, even though Hydraulic has an increased elevation in the vicinity of Commonwealth, but the purpose of the "roof appurtenance stepback" shown in the diagrams is unclear.	Clarify the "roof appurtenance stepback" and confirm that rooftop equipment will not be visible from the ECs.
18	The following should be located to eliminate visibility from the Entrance Corridor street. If, after appropriate siting, these features will still have a negative visual impact on the Entrance Corridor street, screening should be provided to eliminate visibility. a. Loading areas, b. Service areas, c. Refuse areas, d. Storage areas, e. Mechanical equipment, f. Above-ground utilities, and g. Chain link fence, barbed wire, razor wire, and similar security fencing devices.		
19	Screening devices should be compatible with the design of the buildings and surrounding natural vegetation and may consist of: a. Walls, b. Plantings,		

	and c. Fencing.		
21	The following note should be added to the site plan and the architectural plan: "Visibility of all mechanical equipment from the Entrance Corridor shall be eliminated."	The note appears on the cover sheet.	None.
20	Surface runoff structures and detention ponds should be designed to fit into the natural topography to avoid the need for screening. When visible from the Entrance Corridor street, these features must be fully integrated into the landscape. They should not have the appearance of engineered features.	Stormwater will tie into the existing underground system.	None.
22-31	**Lighting**	No lighting is proposed. However, note that building-mounted lights are subject to review.	Provide for review a lighting plan that includes all proposed pole lights, and ground- and building-mounted light fixtures.
	Landscaping		
7	The requirements of the Guidelines regarding landscaping are intended to reflect the landscaping characteristic of many of the area's significant historic sites which is characterized by large shade trees and lawns. Landscaping should promote visual order within the Entrance Corridor and help to integrate buildings into the existing environment of the corridor.	The plan shows that the existing landscaping along the Hydraulic Road frontage does not meet the EC Guidelines. At least one large shade tree is missing from a location near the center of the frontage, and it appears that smaller trees were provided at the west end of the frontage (possibly due to the existence of overhead utility lines). It appears that the trees were also originally provided at 2½" caliper at planting (rather than 3½"). Most of the existing trees are labeled as deciduous and their caliper size is noted on the plan. Species are not noted. A continuous row of shrubs is shown along the frontage. A power easement runs along the frontage.	Provide at least one additional 3½" caliper large shade tree near the center of the Hydraulic Road frontage. See recommendations under #11.
8	Continuity within the Entrance Corridor should be obtained by planting different types of plant materials that share similar characteristics. Such common elements allow for more flexibility in the design of structures because common landscape features will help to harmonize the appearance of development as seen from the street upon which the Corridor is centered.		
32	Landscaping along the frontage of Entrance Corridor streets should include the following: a. Large shade trees should be planted parallel to the Entrance Corridor Street. Such trees should be at least 3½ inches caliper (measured 6 inches above the ground) and should be of a plant species common to		

	the area. Such trees should be located at least every 35 feet on center. b. Flowering ornamental trees of a species common to the area should be interspersed among the trees required by the preceding paragraph. The ornamental trees need not alternate one for one with the large shade trees. They may be planted among the large shade trees in a less regular spacing pattern. c. In situations where appropriate, a three or four board fence or low stone wall, typical of the area, should align the frontage of the Entrance Corridor street. d. An area of sufficient width to accommodate the foregoing plantings and fencing should be reserved parallel to the Entrance Corridor street, and exclusive of road right-of-way and utility easements.		
33	Landscaping along interior roads: a. Large trees should be planted parallel to all interior roads. Such trees should be at least 2½ inches caliper (measured six inches above the ground) and should be of a plant species common to the area. Such trees should be located at least every 40 feet on center.	Existing trees are shown to remain along District Ave. and Inglewood Drive, with some gaps in the required 40' spacing. Four Willow Oaks are proposed to be added along District Ave. to fill the gap there. No trees are added along Inglewood; only the southern third of the Inglewood frontage has trees on the D1 side of the street. Mechanical equipment, parking garage entrance, and on-street parking spaces occupy the frontage with no trees. If the on-street parking spaces are not required, planting area and trees should be added.	Add large shade trees, 2½" caliper at planting, on Inglewood to establish a continuous row spaced 40' on center.
34	Landscaping along interior pedestrian ways: a. Medium trees should be planted parallel to all interior pedestrian ways. Such trees should be at least 2½ inches caliper (measured six inches above the ground) and should be of a species common to the area. Such trees should be located at least every 25 feet on center.	Sidewalks are provided along District, Hydraulic and Inglewood. Trees are provided as described in #32 and #33.	See #32.
35	Landscaping of parking areas: a. Large trees should align the perimeter of parking areas, located 40 feet on center. Trees should be	The existing surface parking lot would be removed with this proposal and a parking garage interior to the building would be	None.

	planted in the interior of parking areas at the rate of one tree for every 10 parking spaces provided and should be evenly distributed throughout the interior of the parking area. b. Trees required by the preceding paragraph should measure 2½ inches caliper (measured six inches above the ground); should be evenly spaced; and should be of a species common to the area. Such trees should be planted in planters or medians sufficiently large to maintain the health of the tree and shall be protected by curbing. c. Shrubs should be provided as necessary to minimize the parking area's impact on Entrance Corridor streets. Shrubs should measure 24 inches in height.	constructed. The garage would not be visible from the streets.	
36	Landscaping of buildings and other structures: a. Trees or other vegetation should be planted along the front of long buildings as necessary to soften the appearance of exterior walls. The spacing, size, and type of such trees or vegetation should be determined by the length, height, and blankness of such walls. b. Shrubs should be used to integrate the site, buildings, and other structures; dumpsters, accessory buildings and structures; "drive thru" windows; service areas; and signs. Shrubs should measure at least 24 inches in height.	The plan shows existing landscaping along the EC frontage that doesn't meet the EC requirements and that appears to differ from the approved plan. Trees are missing and planting sizes are smaller. The landscape plan should be revised to satisfy the EC minimums and to add trees to complement the architectural design and balance the building height.	Revise the landscape plan to satisfy the EC minimums and add trees to complement the architectural design and balance the building height.
37	Plant species: a. Plant species required should be as approved by the Staff based upon but not limited to the *Generic Landscape Plan Recommended Species List* and *Native Plants for Virginia Landscapes (Appendix D)*.	The plant species are found in the recommended lists.	None.
38	Plant health: The following note should be added to the landscape plan: "All site plantings of trees and shrubs shall be allowed to reach, and be maintained at, mature height; the topping of trees is prohibited. Shrubs and trees shall be pruned minimally and only to support the overall health of the plant."	The note is on sheet C-11.	None.
	***Site Development and layout,* Development pattern**		

6	Site development should be sensitive to the existing natural landscape and should contribute to the creation of an organized development plan. This may be accomplished, to the extent practical, by preserving the trees and rolling terrain typical of the area; planting new trees along streets and pedestrian ways and choosing species that reflect native forest elements; insuring that any grading will blend into the surrounding topography thereby creating a continuous landscape; preserving, to the extent practical, existing significant river and stream valleys which may be located on the site and integrating these features into the design of surrounding development; and limiting the building mass and height to a scale that does not overpower the natural settings of the site, or the Entrance Corridor.	The proposed building occupies the entire block as viewed from the Hydraulic corridor. The pattern of roads, lanes, paths and walks are those that already exist at the perimeter of the block, and they connect to adjacent organized circulation systems. The proposed building is oriented parallel to the Hydraulic EC, although the primary entrance is at the opposite end of the building. The site has already been developed as a parking lot; no significant natural features remain. For drivers and pedestrians traveling east on Hydraulic, the view across the Stonefield development to the northeast will be reduced by the proposed 6-8 story building.	None.
39	The relationship of buildings and other structures to the Entrance Corridor street and to other development within the corridor should be as follows: a. An organized pattern of roads, service lanes, bike paths, and pedestrian walks should guide the layout of the site. b. In general, buildings fronting the Entrance Corridor street should be parallel to the street. Building groupings should be arranged to parallel the Entrance Corridor street. c. Provisions should be made for connections to adjacent pedestrian and vehicular circulation systems. d. Open spaces should be tied into surrounding areas to provide continuity within the Entrance Corridor. e. If significant natural features exist on the site (including creek valleys, steep slopes, significant trees or rock outcroppings), to the extent practical, then such natural features should be reflected in the site layout. If the provisions of Section 32.5.2.n of the *Albemarle County Zoning Ordinance* apply, then		

	improvements required by that section should be located so as to maximize the use of existing features in screening such improvements from Entrance Corridor streets. f. The placement of structures on the site should respect existing views and vistas on and around the site.		
	Site Grading		
40	Site grading should maintain the basic relationship of the site to surrounding conditions by limiting the use of retaining walls and by shaping the terrain through the use of smooth, rounded land forms that blend with the existing terrain. Steep cut or fill sections are generally unacceptable. Proposed contours on the grading plan shall be rounded with a ten foot minimum radius where they meet the adjacent condition. Final grading should achieve a natural, rather than engineered, appearance. Retaining walls 6 feet in height and taller, when necessary, shall be terraced and planted to blend with the landscape.	The site has already been graded. The proposal takes advantage of the change in grade across the site, placing 6 stories along Hydraulic and 8 stories at the middle of the building along District Ave. No retaining walls are proposed.	None.
41	No grading, trenching, or tunneling should occur within the drip line of any trees or other existing features designated for preservation in the final Certificate of Appropriateness. Adequate tree protection fencing should be shown on, and coordinated throughout, the grading, landscaping and erosion and sediment control plans.	No grading is shown within the illustrated drip line of existing trees to remain, though the building is shown less than 1' away from some of those trees.	Show how existing trees to remain will be maintained in a healthy condition during construction.
42	Areas designated for preservation in the final Certificate of Appropriateness should be clearly delineated and protected on the site prior to any grading activity on the site. This protection should remain in place until completion of the development of the site.		
43	Preservation areas should be protected from storage or movement of heavy equipment within this area.		
44	Natural drainage patterns (or to the extent required, new drainage patterns) should be incorporated into the finished site to the extent possible.	Drainage will tie into the existing system.	None.

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

Staff recommends the following as the primary points of discussion:

1. The compatibility and appropriateness of the 6-story building height along the Hydraulic Road corridor
2. The character and appearance of the Hydraulic Road elevation
3. The general character and appearance of the apartment building design
4. EC frontage landscaping appropriate for a 6-story building height

Staff offers the following comments on the Special Exception:

It is not clear from the submittal that the 6-story building height will have an appropriate appearance along the Entrance Corridor. The following additional information is requested to determine the appropriateness of the requested building height:

1. A Hydraulic Road street elevation showing the apartment building, the townhouses and the cinema.
2. A "perspective" image showing the Hydraulic elevation head-on.
3. Perspectives from the Hydraulic/Inglewood and Hydraulic/District intersections, clearly showing the building elevations along Hydraulic and the side streets.

Staff offers the following comments on the Initial Site Plan:

- Regarding requirements to satisfy the design guidelines as per § 18-30.6.4c(2), (3) and (5) and recommended conditions of initial plan approval:
  - Staff recommends approval of the initial site plan once the Special Exception issues are resolved.

- Regarding recommendations on the plan as it relates to the guidelines:
  None.

- Regarding conditions to be satisfied prior to issuance of a grading permit:
  None.

- Regarding the final site plan submittal:
  A Certificate of Appropriateness is required prior to final site plan approval.
  1. Provide for review samples of the proposed materials and colors.
  2. Revise the Hydraulic Road elevation to present more of a "primary façade" appearance in line with the materials, balance and use of hierarchy displayed in the Bond Street elevation.
  3. To better determine appropriateness of the propose building along Hydraulic Road, provide the following for review:
     a. A Hydraulic Road street elevation showing the apartment building, the townhouses and the cinema.
     b. A "perspective" image showing the Hydraulic elevation head-on.

c. Perspectives from the Hydraulic/Inglewood and Hydraulic/District intersections, clearly showing the building elevations along Hydraulic and the side streets.

4. Provide for review the full line drawing elevations in color with material/color call-outs.
5. Revise the EC frontage landscaping to promote human scale.
6. Provide specs and a sample for the proposed window glass. Include the standard window glass note on the architectural drawings.
7. Clarify the “roof appurtenance stepback” and confirm that rooftop equipment will not be visible from the ECs.
8. Provide for review a lighting plan that includes all proposed pole lights, and ground- and building-mounted light fixtures.
9. Provide at least one additional 3½” caliper large shade tree near the center of the Hydraulic Road frontage.
10. Add large shade trees, 2½” caliper at planting, on Inglewood to establish a continuous row spaced 40’ on center.
11. Revise the landscape plan to satisfy the EC minimums and add trees to complement the architectural design and balance the building height.
12. Show how existing trees to remain will be maintained in a healthy condition during construction.

TABLE A This report is based on the following submittal items:

Sheet #	Drawing Name		Drawing Date/Revision Date
C1	SITE PLAN	Cover Sheet	10/17/19
C2		Abbreviations and legend	10/17/19
C3		General Notes	10/17/19
C4		Earthwork Requirements	10/17/19
C5		Proffers	10/17/19
C6		Existing Conditions	10/17/19
C7		Demolition Plan	10/17/19
C8		Site Layout Plan	10/17/19
C9		Details	10/17/19
C10-11		Landscaping Plan Details and Notes	10/17/19
1-2	ARB PRELIMINARY REVIEW		11/4/19
3		Description	11/4/19
4		Vicinity	11/4/19
5		Site Photos	11/4/19
6-7		Site Plans	11/4/19
8-10		Landscape Plans	11/4/19
11		Context	11/4/19
12-15		Perspective Illustrations	11/4/19
16-19		Elevations	11/4/19
20		Exterior Palette	11/4/19
1	SPECIAL EXCEPTION APPLICATION		11/4/19
2		Vicinity	11/4/19
3		Existing Development Site D1 Plan	11/4/19
4-5		Site Plan Existing, Proposed	11/4/19
6		Contextual Building Story Diagram	11/4/19
7		Building Stories Study	11/4/19
8		Building Stories at District Avenue	11/4/19
9		Bond St. & District Ave. Proposed rendering	11/4/19
10		Hydraulic Rd. & District Ave. Proposed rendering	11/4/19